

РОССИЙСКАЯ АКАДЕМИЯ НАУК
ИНСТИТУТ СЛАВЯНОВЕДЕНИЯ

ИССЛЕДОВАНИЯ
ПО ЛИНГВИСТИКЕ
И СЕМИОТИКЕ



*Сборник статей к юбилею
Вяч. Вс. Иванова*

Ответственный редактор
Т. М. Николаева



ЯЗЫКИ СЛАВЯНСКИХ КУЛЬТУР
МОСКВА 2010

СОДЕРЖАНИЕ

Вопросы теории

<i>T. V. Gamkrelidze.</i> «Paradigms» in linguistics and the problem of the isomorphism between the Genetic Code & Semiotic Systems.....	11
<i>A. E. Кибрик.</i> Место сравнительного языкознания в кругу лингвистических дисциплин	16
<i>В. К. Финн.</i> Принципы искусственного интеллекта и феноменология сознания.....	27
<i>G. Buccellati.</i> The question of digital thought.....	46
<i>В. Г. Лысенко.</i> «Лингвистический детерминизм» Эмиля Бенвениста и случай вайшешики	56
<i>R. K. Englund.</i> The Smell of the Cage	68

Сравнительно-историческое языкознание

<i>А. Ю. Милитарев.</i> О возможности пролить свет на интеллектуальную культуру доисторического человека (на примере праафразийских терминов, связанных с музыкой, пением и танцем)	97
<i>M. Valério, I. Yakubovich.</i> Semitic word for 'iron' as an Anatolian loanword	108
<i>V. Blažek.</i> Hurrian numerals.....	117
<i>N. Operstein.</i> Two developments of Proto-Zapotec * <i>ty</i> and * <i>ty</i>	124
<i>I. Klock-Fontanille.</i> Le loup en hittite et louvite: exclusion et rassemblement.....	135
<i>H. C. Melchert.</i> Hittite <i>talliyē(šš)</i> - 'be(come) calm, quiescent'	148
<i>J. Puhvel.</i> Notes on Anatolian sibling terms.....	153
<i>V. Shevoroshkin.</i> Four notes on Milyan.....	156
<i>R. Anttila.</i> Unmasking <i>Gustav</i> — once again	168
<i>L. I. Kulikov.</i> Atharvaveda-Śaunakīya 19.49.1 = Atharvaveda-Paipalāda 14.8.1: An etymological note on Vedic <i>rātrī-</i> 'night'	174
<i>J. P. Mallory.</i> Semantic field and cognate distribution in Indo-European.....	180
<i>B. Vine, O. T. Yokoyama.</i> PIE *(<i>h</i>) <i>eu</i> ₁ - <i>dh-</i> 'excrete liquid' and Russian Dialectal <i>udut</i> (3 pl.)	191
<i>Ж. Ж. Варбот.</i> Рус. разгов. <i>сечь</i> 'понимать' — неологизм или архаизм?	197
<i>Т. М. Николаева.</i> Русский и хеттский — через тысячелетия.....	200

Грамматика, лексика, типология

<i>Ю. Д. Апресян.</i> Принципы лексикографического описания многозначных слов	214
<i>Е. В. Падучева.</i> Метонимия как сдвиг фокуса внимания	231
<i>В. С. Храковский.</i> О зависимом/независимом статусе ситуаций	248
<i>А. А. Зализняк.</i> Ударение просодических комплексов в истории русского языка	257
<i>Л. Л. Касаткин.</i> Неопределенные местоимения и наречия с постфиксом/ суффиксом <i>-ся/-сь</i> в говорах русских старообрядцев	269
<i>М. С. Флайер.</i> Суржик или суржики?	278
<i>Р. Ф. Касаткина.</i> Ларингализация в русской фонетике — сегментный уровень	293
<i>R. M. W. Dixon.</i> Gradual loss of a gender contrast	299
<i>A. Y. Aikhenvald.</i> Typological plausibility and historical reconstruction: A puzzle from New Guinea	306
<i>W. R. Schmalstieg.</i> Some common functions of the dative, accusative, and locative cases	315
<i>П. М. Аркадьев.</i> И невозможное возможно: Типологические заметки о взаимодействии падежа с другими морфологическими категориями	322
<i>Б. Огибенин.</i> О выражении грамем в склонении имен в буддийском санскрите	334
<i>С. А. Бурлак, И. Б. Иткин.</i> <i>Yreki et autres addenda et corrigenda-2</i>	339

Культурология и семиотика

<i>J. Kordys.</i> Of gifts, sovereigns, and philosophers	359
<i>А. И. Коваль.</i> Ремесленники Слова у фульбе (Субсахарская Африка)	366
<i>С. Ю. Неклюдов, Е. С. Новик.</i> Невидимый и нежеланный гость	391
<i>М. В. Завьялова.</i> Мифологема гороха и боба в контексте основного мифа (на балто-славянском материале)	407
<i>Е. В. Пчелов.</i> «Лев и Единорог» в русской культуре: К вопросу о семантике символов	424
<i>М. Мейлах.</i> «Не оглядывайся!»: Где, когда и позади кого оглянулась Лотова жена?	434
<i>Т. В. Цивьян.</i> Богини изваянье	458

<i>И. А. Протопопова.</i> Метафора «воскового отпечатка» в греческой философии	475
<i>Л. Флейшман.</i> Отклики в русском Париже на «Зимнюю войну»	481

Структура текста

<i>М. Ланглебен.</i> Рассказ И. Бунина «Сны» и <i>Откровение Св. Иоанна</i>	501
<i>Г. А. Левинтон.</i> Заметки об Ив́ановых	515
<i>N. Pollak.</i> Akhmatova's two imitations of I. F. Annenskii	530
<i>R. Vroon.</i> Nets, stars and numbers: Some notes on Velimir Khlebnikov's cosmology	536
<i>А. Хан.</i> О значении образа «глухой вселенной» в контексте цикла «Занятие философией» Бориса Пастернака	541
<i>Д. М. Сегал.</i> Доктор Живаго — еврейский роман?	551
<i>Ф. Б. Успенский.</i> Об отдельных случаях неявной иконичности в русской литературе	560
<i>Н. В. Злыднева.</i> Экфрасис в «Путешествии в Армению» Мандельштама: проблема референции	570
<i>Е. А. Панкова.</i> Русский народный утопический идеал в творчестве Всеволода Иванова	578
<i>I. Merkoulouva.</i> Les mécanismes du dialogue: Polyphonie, ponctuation, énonciation	588

* * *

Jakobson in My Life: An Excerpt from <i>The Blue Beast</i> (translated from Russian by Michael Henry Heim)	603
---	-----

HITTITE *TALLIYĒ(ŠŠ)*- ‘BE(COME) CALM, QUIESCENT’

Prominent among Professor Ivanov’s astonishingly diverse range of interests is the study of Hittite in both its synchronic and diachronic aspects. It is a pleasure to offer him as a modest token of esteem the following lexical analysis.

Hittite attests a fientive verb *talliyēšš*- whose approximate meaning ‘be(come) calm, pacified, soothed’ is clear from its occurrence in VBoT 24 iii 37—39 (Ritual of Anniyawanni, pre-NH/NS): *anda=kan eḫu* ^dLAMMA ^{KUŠ}*kuršaš nu=nnāš=šan anda miyēš nu=nnāš=šan anda talliyēš karpinn=a kartimmiyattan šāuwar arḫa tarna* ‘Come in, Tutelary Deity of the Hunting Bag, become mild toward us, become calm toward us. Let go of anger, wrath and resentment.’ Noteworthy in this example, in addition to the obvious parallelism with *miyēšš*- ‘become mild, gentle’, is the co-occurrence with the local particle *-šan*, for which see [Hoffner, Melchert 2008: 376—377].

We also find the verb *talliyēšš*- in one other passage, KUB 31.127+ iv 8-10 (Prayer to the Sun-god, pre-NH/NS): *nu=mu* DINGIR=*YA dallišš[a]nti* UN-*ši* UD.KAM.ḪI.A *idala(w)ēš* GE₆-*uš* ḪUL-*ēš maninkuwan lē tarnatti* ‘Do not, my god, let evil days and evil nights near me, a *t. man.*’. Since Lebrun [1980: 106], the participle *dalliššanti* has been interpreted as ‘bewildered, distraught’: see also Tischler [1991: 58] and Singer [2002: 39]¹. No justification has ever been given for this interpretation, or any explanation as to how such a sense can be derived from the meaning ‘become calm, soothed’ required by the other occurrence. No such development is in fact necessary. A meaning ‘quiescent’ fits the context of the prayer quite well. Having been chastened and humbled by grievous illness, the speaker is expressing his resigned acceptance of this previous punishment and asking that he be spared any more². We may thus assume a unitary sense ‘be(come) calm, quiescent’ for *talliyēšš*-.

As established by Watkins [1973: 73—83], Hittite fientive verbs in *-ēšš*- are based on stative-fientive stems in *-ē*-. cf. *tannatte*- ‘be(come) deserted’ beside *tannattešš*- ‘become deserted’ among other such pairs. I suggest that we likewise have evidence for a hitherto unrecognized *talliyē*- ‘be(come) calm, pacified’ alongside *talliyēšš*-. One occurrence is found in KUB 17.10 ii 12—14 (Telipinu Myth, OH/MS): *kāša galaktar kitta [ištanza=šiš/*

¹ Despite the claim of [Lebrun 1980: 109], erroneously repeated by [Tischler, Laroche 1964: 27] did *not* suggest the meaning ‘égaré’. Laroche explicitly left open the sense of the verb *talliyēšš*- and its possible relationship to the transitive verb *talliyē/a*- (on which see below). So far as I can determine, Lebrun is the originator of the alleged sense ‘égaré’.

² One citation offered by the *Oxford English Dictionary* s. v. ‘quiescent’ is ‘quiescent resignation’.

ZI=ŠU] *galankanza ēštu kāša parḥ[uenāš kitta] karaz=šan talliyēd[du]* ‘Here lies balm/soothing. [Let his soul] be soothed. [Here lies] *p*. Let (his) insides be(come) calm/pacified.’ My restorations follow those of the *CHD* (P 150), which are based on parallel passages involving *galaktar* and *parḥuenāš*, but the translation of the last clause as ‘let it implore(?) his *karaz*’ is quite impossible. First of all, *karaz* is animate nominative singular and cannot be the direct object of the transitive verb *talliyē/a*-³. Hoffner [1998: 16] translates ‘Here lies *galaktar*. May [your soul, O Telipinu], be made tranquil. Here [lies] *parḥuenas*-fruit. May (its) essence(?) implore him, [namely, Telipinu].’ His implied reading of the spelling *ka-ra-az-ša-an* as /karats=an/, animate nominative singular subject plus enclitic animate accusative pronoun *-an* ‘him’, is orthographically possible and supplies the needed direct object for the transitive verb. However, *karat-* in passages such as this describing the soothing of a deity who has withdrawn in anger *always* refers to the deity. The pair *ištanzan-* ‘soul’ and *karat-* ‘innards’ sometimes forms a virtual hendiadys ‘innermost being’ (see [Puhvel 1997: 75—76]). The habitual pairing of ‘soul’ and ‘innards’ in this context requires a likewise parallel construction in the Telipinu example: just as the soul is to be soothed by the *galaktar*, so are the innards to be calmed by the *parḥuenāš* (whatever the precise nature of these substances). The stem *talliyē-* naturally co-occurs with *-šan* just like *talliyēšš*-⁴.

This interpretation is confirmed by the passage KUB 33.62 ii 14-15 (Ritual for the Storm-god of Kuliwišna, pre-NH/MS): *parḥuenāš=šan kitta nu=ššan parā tallianz[a] ēš kalaktar=šan kitta nu=ššan parā k[alankanza ēš]* ‘*p*. is laid down. Be(come) fully pacified therein/thereby! Balm/soothing is laid down. [Be] fully s[oothed] therein/thereby!’. Glocker [1997: 36—37] and the *CHD* (P 150) still regard *tallianza* as the participle of the transitive verb *talliya-*, rendering it respectively as ‘Sei gewogen gemacht!’ and ‘so be called forth’. This interpretation is precluded by the fact that the transitive verb *talliyē/a-* that typically takes deities or the spirits of the dead as its direct object *never* co-occurs with the particle *-šan*⁵. Furthermore, the parallelism of *parḥuenāš...parā tallianza* and *kalaktar...parā k[alankanza]* calls for a likewise parallel sense of *parā* as ‘completely, fully’. On this usage see the *CHD* (P 126).

For *talliyant-* as the expected participle of a stative-fientive stem *talliyē-* compare *nakkīyant-* to *nakkīyē-* ‘be heavy, weigh upon’ ([*n*]a-ak-ki-ya-an-te-eš in KBo 12.101: 3 as cited by the *CHD* L-N 369). The stative-fientive stem *talliyē(šš)-* is in fact entirely parallel to *nakkīyē(šš)-* ‘to weigh upon’ < *nakki-* ‘heavy’. Reading of the stem as *nakkīyē(šš)-* (not *nakkē(šš)-*) is assured not only by the participle just cited, but also by the incomplete example *na-ak-ki-ya-a[n-zi/te-eš]* in KUB 33.97 i 9, for which see the

³ I will soon discuss elsewhere the Hittite transitive verb *talliyē/a-*, usually translated as ‘implore, invoke’, but properly ‘to draw, allure’. See note 9.

⁴ Probably also here belongs []*kāša parḥ[uenāš... /...tal-]i-ya-a[d-du]* in KUB 33.69: 3—4.

⁵ The transitive verb co-occurs with *-kan* only in the combination *arḥa talliya-* ‘to draw/lure away’.

CHD (L-N 368)⁶ and by the alternate form *nakkiyašzi* beside *nakkiēšzi* (*CHD* L-N 371). Oettinger [1979: 251] indeed already derives *talliyēšš-* from a putative *i*-stem adjective *talli-* with an approximate meaning ‘welcome, pleasant’, based on the hapax *ta-al-li-eš* in a passage in the royal funeral rites (likewise: [Tischler 1991: 58]).

However, as now shown by [Kassian et al. 2002: 516—518, 544—545], it is unlikely that such an *i*-stem adjective exists. Based on their restorations from the new fragment KBo 39.290 Ro 9-12 we may now read KUB 30.19+20+39.7 iv 17-21 as: *nu* ^{NINDA}*harašpauwa*[*nduš* (^{NINDA}*talluš*)] *iyanzi nu=uš PANI ALAM zikkan*[*z(i)*] § *ANA GUNNI kue harpali harpanda nu=šš*[*a*(^{NINDA}*harašpauwa*)*nduš*] *apēdaš šer zikkanzi nu kišš*[*an t/daranzi*] *kī=wa=tta talleš ašan*[*du*] ‘They make *h*.-breads (into) *t*.-breads and place them before the image. They place [(the *h*.-loaves)] on the piles that are piled up on the hearth, and [they speak] thus: «May these *talla-* be for you».’ Kassian et al. try to rescue the derivation of our verb from the actually attested (^{NINDA})*talla-* by reading NINDA *ta-al-lu-uš* ‘soft breads’, taking *talla-* as an adjective ‘soft’ and reading the derived verb as *tallešš-*. They explicitly dismiss the evidence of *tal-li-i-e-eš* in VBoT 24 iii 39 for a stem *talliyēšš-*, attributing it to the influence of the preceding *mi-i-e-eš*. However, the evidence of *tal-li-i-e-ed*-[*du*] in KUB 17.10 ii 14 and of the participle *tal-li-an-z*[*a*] in KUB 33.62 ii 14 shows that the stem *talliyē(šš)-* is genuine, and it cannot be derived from an *a*-stem adjective *talla-*.

The existence of such an adjective meaning ‘soft’ is in any case highly dubious. First of all, the reading NINDA *ta-al-lu-uš*, with a logogram for a plural ‘breads’ without plural marker or phonetic complement followed by an inflected adjective, is extremely unlikely. We have rather ^{NINDA}*ta-al-lu-uš* with a determinative, just like the preceding ^{NINDA}*har-aš-pa-u-wa-an-du-uš*. Furthermore, against Kassian et al., the two kinds of bread are not separate offerings, but the same: the text says that they make the *h*-breads into *talla*-breads and place them on the hearth in front of the image of the deceased⁷. This strongly suggests that *talleš* in the last clause is part of the subject: ‘Let these *talla*-(breads) be for you/be yours.’ In any case, even if *talleš* is predicative, all evidence argues that it is a noun: ‘Let these be *talla*-(breads) for you.’

The precise meaning of (^{NINDA})*talla-* cannot be determined, but it is likely that there is a relationship to the other animate noun *talla/i-* attested at IBoT 3.1:78, 79, 81 (*tal-lu-uš* KUŠ SA₅, *tal-li-uš*, *tal-lu-uš*). Against [Tischler 1991: 56] and [Kassian et al. 2002: 545], there is no basis for supposing that this noun has anything to do with the neuter noun ^{DUG/GIŠ}*tallai-* referring to a vessel (correctly separated by Röble 2002: 168⁵⁸⁰). That a kind of bread and another object share the same appellation is not unprecedented: cf.

⁶ The *CHD* restores a present third plural, but the context would also permit a predicative participle. In either case, the form *nakkiya-* shows that the stative stem is *nakkiyē-*, against the *CHD*’s own ‘*nakke-*’. The presence of the fientive *nakkiyēšš-* argues decisively against assuming a stem *nakkiye/a-* with a **ye/o-* suffix.

⁷ The preceding line 16 assures us that ‘before the image’ and ‘on the hearth’ refer to the same place: *n=at=šan haššī AN*[(*A PANI ALAM tianzi*)] ‘and they place it on the hearth in front of the image’.

^{NINDA}*harši-* ‘leavened bread’ and ^{DUG}*harši-* (container), for which [Puhvel 1991: 197] aptly compares the range of meanings of French ‘boule’.

The form and meaning of *talliyē(šš)-* ‘be(come) calm, quiescent’ require assumption of an unattested adjective **talli-* ‘still, calm’ < **té/ólHi-*, entirely parallel to *šalliēšš-* ‘become large’ < *šalli-* ‘large, grown’ < **sé/ólh₂i-* (for the latter see [Rieken 2005: 55—58])⁸. The PIE root **telH-* is that seen in Lithuanian *tilti* ‘fall silent’ and *tylėti* ‘be silent’, Old Irish *con-tuili* ‘sleeps’, Russian утoлѣти and Serbo-Croatian (*u*)*tòliti* ‘satisfy (hunger), quench (thirst), alleviate (pain etc.)’, and Slovenian *toliti* ‘console, comfort’⁹.

REFERENCES

- CHD* = The Hittite Dictionary of the Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago / Ed. by H. G. Güterbock†, H. A. Hoffner, Jr., T. van den Hout. Chicago: The Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago, 1980 — .
- Glocker 1997 — *Glocker J.* Das Ritual für den Wettergott von Kuliwišna. Firenze: LoGisma, 1997.
- Hoffner 1987 — *Hoffner H. A., Jr.* Paskuwatti’s Ritual Against Sexual Impotence // *Aula Orientalis*. 1987. 5. P. 271—287.
- Hoffner 1998 — *Hoffner H. A., Jr.* Hittite Myths. Second edition. Atlanta: Scholars Press, 1998.
- Hoffner, Melchert 2008 — *Hoffner H. A., Jr.; Melchert H. C.* A Grammar of the Hittite Language. Winona Lake IN: Eisenbrauns, 2008.
- Kassian, Korolëv†, Sidel’sev 2002 — *Kassian A., Korolëv A.†, Sidel’sev A.* Hittite Funerary Ritual *šallaiš waštaiš*. Münster: Ugarit-Verlag, 2002.
- Laroche 1964 — *Laroche E.* La prière hittite: vocabulaire et typologie. École pratique des Hautes Études. V^e section, sciences religieuses. Annuaire. 1964. T. 72.
- Lebrun 1980 — *Lebrun R.* Hymnes et prières hittites. Louvain-la-Neuve: Centre d’histoire des religions, 1980.
- Oettinger 1979 — *Oettinger N.* Die Stammbildung des hethitischen Verbuns. Nürnberg: Carl, 1979.
- Puhvel 1991 — *Puhvel J.* Hittite Etymological Dictionary. Vol. 3: Words beginning with H. Berlin; New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 1991.
- Puhvel 1997 — *Puhvel J.* Hittite Etymological Dictionary. Vol. 4: Words beginning with K. Berlin; New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 1997.
- Rieken 2005 — *Rieken E.* Neues zum Ursprung der anatolischen *i*-Mutation // *Historische Sprachforschung*. 2005. 118. P. 48—74.

⁸ A connection with ^(NINDA)*talla-* would be possible only with the assumption of a parallel action/result noun **tólHo-* ‘calming’ that was secondarily reinterpreted as ‘means of calming’, thus ‘object of propitiation’ or the like. In the absence of much stronger evidence for the synchronic meaning of the noun(s) *talla-* I prefer to leave aside this speculation.

⁹ I thus accept the root etymology of Eichner apud Oettinger [1979: 346] for the denominative stative-fientive verb *talliyē(šš)-* (cf.: [Ibid.: 251]), but not for the transitive verb *talliye/a-*, which in my view means ‘draw, allure’ (with [Laroche 1964: 27; Hoffner 1987: 277, 285]), not ‘gewogen/mild machen, beruhigen’.

- Rößle 2002 — *Rößle S.* Sprachvergleichende Untersuchungen zu den hethitischen *āi*-Stämmen. Ein Beitrag zu hethitischen Sprachgeschichte. PhD Dissertation. Universität Augsburg, 2002.
- Singer 2002 — *Singer I.* Hittite Prayers. Atlanta: Society of Biblical Literature, 2002.
- Tischler 1991 — *Tischler J.* Hethitisches Etymologisches Glossar. Teil III. Lieferung 8. Innsbruck: Institut für Sprachwissenschaft der Universität Innsbruck, 1991.
- Watkins 1973 — *Watkins C.* Hittite and Indo-European Studies: the denominative statives in *-ē-// Transactions of the Philological Society. 1971. P. 51—93.