

ANATOLIAN INTERFACES

HITTITES, GREEKS AND THEIR NEIGHBOURS

*Proceedings of an International Conference on Cross-Cultural Interaction,
September 17–19, 2004, Emory University, Atlanta, GA*

edited by

*Billie Jean Collins, Mary R. Bachvarova
and Ian C. Rutherford*

Oxbow Books

Published by
Oxbow Books, Oxford, UK

© Oxbow Books and the individual authors, 2008

ISBN 978-1-84217-270-4

A CIP record for this book is available from the British Library

This book is available direct from

Oxbow Books, Oxford, UK
(Phone: 01865-241249; Fax: 01865-794449)

and

The David Brown Book Company
PO Box 511, Oakville, CT 06779, USA
(Phone: 860-945-9329; Fax: 860-945-9468)

or from our website

www.oxbowbooks.com

Cover illustrations

Drawing of Mycenaean warrior on a clay fragment from Boghazköy
(courtesy of the Bogazköy-Archive, Deutsches Archäologisches Institut).

Photo of the relief of Tarkasnawa, king of Mira, at Karabel
(courtesy of Billie Jean Collins).

Printed in Great Britain by
Short Run Press, Exeter

CONTENTS

<i>Preface</i>	v
<i>Abbreviations</i>	vi
<i>Maps</i>	viii

Introduction	1
--------------	---

PART 1

HISTORY, ARCHAEOLOGY AND THE MYCENAEAN-ANATOLIAN INTERFACE

1. Troy as a "Contested Periphery": Archaeological Perspectives on Cross-Cultural and Cross-Disciplinary Interactions Concerning Bronze Age Anatolia (*Eric H. Cline*) 11
2. Purple-Dyers in Lazpa (*Itamar Singer*) 21
3. Multiculturalism in the Mycenaean World (*Stavroula Nikoloudis*) 45
4. Hittite Lesbos? (*Hugh J. Mason*) 57

PART 2

SACRED INTERACTIONS

5. The Seer Mopsos as a Historical Figure (*Norbert Oettinger*) 63
6. Setting up the Goddess of the Night Separately (*Jared L. Miller*) 67
7. The Songs of the *Zintuḫis*: Chorus and Ritual in Anatolia and Greece (*Ian C. Rutherford*) 73

PART 3

IDENTITY AND LITERARY TRADITIONS

8. Homer at the Interface (*Trevor Bryce*) 85
9. The Poet's Point of View and the Prehistory of the *Iliad* (*Mary R. Bachvarova*) 93
10. Hittite Ethnicity? Constructions of Identity in Hittite Literature (*Amir Gilan*) 107

PART 4
IDENTITY AND LANGUAGE CHANGE

- | | |
|--|-----|
| 11. Writing Systems and Identity (<i>Annick Payne</i>) | 117 |
| 12. Luwian Migration in Light of Linguistic Contacts (<i>Ilya Yakubovitch</i>) | 123 |
| 13. "Hermit Crabs," or New Wine in Old Bottles: Anatolian-Hellenic Connections
from Homer and Before to Antiochus I of Commagene and After (<i>Calvert Watkins</i>) | 135 |
| 14. Possessive Constructions in Anatolian, Hurrian and Urartian as Evidence
for Language Contact (<i>Silvia Luraghi</i>) | 143 |
| 15. Greek <i>mólybdos</i> as a Loanword from Lydian (<i>H. Craig Melchert</i>) | 153 |

PART 5
ANATOLIA AS INTERMEDIARY: THE FIRST MILLENNIUM

- | | |
|--|-----|
| 16. Kybele as Kubaba in a Lydo-Phrygian Context (<i>Mark Munn</i>) | 159 |
| 17. King Midas in Southeastern Anatolia (<i>Maya Vassileva</i>) | 165 |
| 18. The GALA and the Gallos (<i>Patrick Taylor</i>) | 173 |
| 19. Patterns of Elite Interaction: Animal-Headed Vessels in Anatolia in the Eighth
and Seventh Centuries BC (<i>Susanne Ebbinghaus</i>) | 181 |
| 20. "A Feast of Music": The Greco-Lydian Musical Movement on the Assyrian Periphery
(<i>John Curtis Franklin</i>) | 191 |
| General Index | 203 |

GREEK ΜÓΛΥΒΔΟΣ AS A LOANWORD FROM LYDIAN

H. Craig Melchert

Beekes (1999, 7–8) has established that the oldest form of the Greek word for “lead” is Mycenaean *mo-ri-wo-do* (for attestations of the word see Aura Jorro 1985, 1, 457–58). Beekes reads the Mycenaean as /moliwdos/, but one must also consider /molivdos/, as suggested by Chantraine (1968, 710 and 1972, 205–6).¹ As per Beekes (1999, 10), all later variants of the word in Greek can be derived from the shape attested in Mycenaean.

The earliest Greek form /moliw/vdos/ precludes any connections of the word with Latin *plumbum* or Basque *berun* “lead” (thus with Beekes 1999, 10–11). Beekes, who argues for Asia Minor as the source of the Greek word, cites in passing Lydian *mariwda-* after Furnée, but merely as an example of the sequence *-wd-* in a language of Asia Minor. He can do nothing further with the Lydian word attested as a divine name.

Recent research, however, has removed the Lydian word from its isolation and provided it with a meaning and morphological analysis. The word occurs just once in Lydian in Text 4a in a curse formula against a potential tomb violator (text per Gusmani 1986, 148): *fak=mλ śāntas kufaw=k mariwda=k ěnslibb[i]d* “Sanda and Kubaba and (the) *m.* shall do harm to him.”

The association of *mariwda* with Sanda points to a connection with the Luwian divine name /marway(a)-/, as attested in Hieroglyphic Luwian in KULULU 2, §9 (text per Hawkins 2000, 488): *wa/i-ru-ta | (DEUS)sà-ta-si-i-zi | (DEUS)ma_x+ra/i-wa/i-i-zi-i | (“*256”)tà-sá-za | a-ta | “CRUS”-tu* “Let the dark deities of Sanda step on his memorial.” For the association of the *marwainzi*-deities (the form is animate nominative plural) with the god Sanda see Popko (1995, 93). For the reading as /marwainzi/ and interpretation “dark” see Melchert and Starke apud Oettinger (1989/1990, 97) and now Hawkins (2000, 489–90). As per Starke (1986, 162–63), the Cuneiform Luwian cognate is also attested in Hittite context as ^d*Mar-wa-ya-an-za* (dative plural), for which the Hittite equivalent is ^d*Mar-ku-wa-ya-aš*. The PIE root is **morg-* “dark” as in English “murk(y)” etc. (Neumann 1973, 298). Hittite *mark(u)waya-* and Luwian *marwaya-* form a direct equation reflecting an adjective **morg^o-iyo-*. For this formation with the suffix **-iyo-* see Melchert (1990, 201–2).

It cannot be a coincidence that the single occurrence of Lydian *mariwda* accompanies one of only two instances of Sanda in our entire Lydian corpus.² Context argues that Lydian *mariwdaš* (with regular loss of *-š* before *-k* “and”) is also animate nominative plural “the dark ones” and refers to the deities who accompany Sanda. The Lydian word may reflect **morg^o-iyo-* (for the formation see again Melchert 1990, 201), with regular development to **marwida-* (Melchert 1994, 184–85). I now follow a suggestion of Norbert Oettinger (pers. comm.) in assuming that **marwida-* became **marwda-* with regular syncope (see Melchert 1997, 185) and then *mariwda-* with anaptyxis of *-i-* in the difficult cluster **-rwd-* (contra Melchert 2002, 242, n. 9, with the unlikely assumption of a direct metathesis **-rwi- > -riw-*).

We thus have good evidence for a Lydian adjective *mariwda-* “dark.” Its phonetic shape is approximately [marivða-]. For Lydian *w* as a voiced labial fricative [v] or [β] compare *lews/leš* as the Lydian rendering of “Zeus,” where *w* alternates with the voiceless labial fricative *f*. For Lydian *d* as something other than a stop

[d] see Melchert (1997, 45 with references). A voiced “flap” as in American English “ladder” is also quite possible instead of a fricative [ð] as in “lather.”

Names for metals are commonly derived from color adjectives: compare Latin *argentum* “silver” < PIE **h₂erǵ-* “bright white” or English “gold” < PIE **ǵhel-* “yellow.” For “lead” specifically as a “dark/black” metal we may compare Latin *plumbum nigrum* “black lead” (vs. *plumbum album/candidum* “white lead” = “tin”).³ Use of Lydian *mariwda-* “(the) dark (metal)” for “lead” would be a case of a “transferred epithet.”

Greek substitution of /l/ for /r/ in the borrowing process is unsurprising. For variation between *l* and *r* within Lydian itself we may cite *mētlid/mētrid* “harm.” The Greek word for a kind of “scraper” *stlēngís/strengís/stelgís/stergís* (and further variants) probably represents a loanword from Anatolian to the root of Hittite *ištalk-* “make smooth, flatten” with original *l* (Neumann 1961, 94–95). The fact that /r/ and /l/ are contrastive sounds in both the source language Lydian and the borrowing language Greek does not in any way preclude the substitution. Speakers do not always make the expected identification of a sound of another language with the corresponding one in their own.⁴ Since we do not know just when prehistoric **o* became Lydian *a*, it is possible that the *o* of /moliwdos/ reflects a Lydian **o*. Lydian *mariwda-* “dark, black” is thus a suitable source for Greek /moliwdos/ “lead” in terms of both form and meaning. The further plausibility of Greek /moliwdos/ as a loanword from Lydian depends on factors of chronology, geography and the material evidence for sources of lead in Mycenaean Greece.

I will first address the problem of chronology. The appearance of the word in Mycenaean requires borrowing by no later than the fifteenth century BC, but it may have happened earlier (thus also Beekes 1999, 12). Van den Hout (2003, 304–7) has argued that the Lydian change **y > d* is already reflected in the place-name *Maddun(n)aš(š)a* and the personal names *Mad(d)unāni* and *Madduwatta* attested in Hittite cuneiform sources. He derives Lydian **madun-* from **may-un-* from **māi-won-* with the “ethnicon” suffix seen in Luwian *-wann(i)-* (e.g., ^{URU}*Ninuwawann(i)-* “of Niniveh”).⁵ The same word, without the characteristic Lydian sound change, he sees attested in Greek *Meion/Maion-* “Maeonian.” The name *Madduwatta* (compare for the formation with van den Hout [2003, 305] the Lydian names *Alyattes* and *Sadyattes*) is attested already from the late-fifteenth century.

The evidence just cited gives only a terminus ante quem. The borrowing could be considerably older. Differentiation of the Anatolian Indo-European languages must date minimally from ca. 2300 BC, but it probably begins far earlier: see among others Carruba (1995, 30–31), Starke (1997, 457) and Oettinger (2002, 52). Since we unfortunately cannot independently determine the relative chronology of pre-Lydian sound changes, that of **y > d* could have happened any time during the period from roughly 2500–1500.

Beekes (2003) has now suggested that the Greek name for the Lydians *lūđó-* reflects the Lydian form of the name *Luwiya*.⁶ He plausibly assumes that when the Lydians moved from northwestern Asia Minor into classical Lydia, which was Luwian territory in the second millennium, they adopted the name of their new dwelling place. He dates this event to some time after 1200 and suggests that this is also the likely date of the change **y > d*. However, as he concedes, nothing at all precludes that the Lydians had had contact with the Luwians at a much earlier date and learned *luwiya-* as the name for the Luwians. It could then have undergone the change to Lydian **luw(i)da-* at any time, long before the Lydians moved southward and adopted the name for their own new country. I therefore stand by the claim that the Lydian change **y > d* and hence the borrowing of *mariwda-* into Greek could potentially have happened any time in the long period of approximately 2500–1500 BC.⁷

I turn next to the matter of geography. There is a growing consensus that the Lydians in the earlier-second millennium were located in the northwest of Asia Minor (later Mysia or Bithynia). See most extensively and emphatically Beekes (2002, 206–17), but compare also more tentatively Starke (1997, 457), Neumann (2001, 46), Högemann (2001, 59–60), Oettinger (2002: 52) and Melchert (2003, 22). If the Greek word for “lead” is a loanword from Lydian before 1500, then the Lydians must have found and exploited lead in northwestern

Asia Minor, not in classical Lydia. Buchholz (1972, 49) cites areas in northwestern, northeastern and south-central Asia Minor as possible sources for lead in Mycenaean Greece. Of those areas given for the northwest, one lies in Mysia and one in Bithynia. Either of these would be compatible with a Lydian source for the Greek word for "lead."

I come finally to the question of what we know about the source of lead objects found in Mycenaean contexts.⁸ Buchholz opted very cautiously for northwest Asia Minor: "Die Galena-Vorkommen des kleinasiatischen Westens ... werden es gewesen sein, aus denen Troja und Teile der Ägäis beliefert wurden" (1972, 48). However, subsequent investigation, particularly lead isotope analysis, points to local sources of lead for objects found in Mycenaean contexts: the Cycladic island of Siphnos and the Laurion field in Attica (the former predominant in the Early and Middle Bronze Age, the latter in the Late Bronze Age; see Gale, Stos-Gale and Davis [1984, 390] and Mossman [2000, 87, 103–4]). There is no positive evidence for importation of lead from the western Mediterranean (Iberia, Sardinia) or from Asia Minor: see in detail Gale (1979). For negative evidence for at least some northwestern sites in Asia Minor see plots for 12, 14, 15 on his fig. 4 (for sites see fig. 1). Gale and Stos-Gale (1981, 217) arrive at similar conclusions.

Current evidence for the provenance of Mycenaean lead objects thus seems equally unfavorable to the two most popular hypotheses for the source of the Greek word for "lead": a loanword from the western Mediterranean or from Asia Minor. However, one fact about Mycenaean lead objects may still allow us to entertain northwest Asia Minor as the *earliest* source of lead for Mycenaean Greece. The distribution of lead objects appears to shift from the Early to Late Bronze Age. EBA objects cluster in Troy, Lesbos, the Cyclades, East and Central Crete, with very few on the Greek mainland. Those of the Late Bronze Age are concentrated in the Peloponnese, Argolid, Attica and Euboea (see Buchholz 1972, 23). Branigan (1974) reaches similar results indicating a possible east to west shift. Despite their results cited above pointing to Mycenaean exploitation of local sources of lead, allowance for a possible earlier source in Asia Minor is made by Gale (1979, 33) and Stos-Gale and Gale (1982, 472): "One interpretation of these facts (but an interpretation that awaits proof) is that sources of lead/silver for the Aegean may originally have been in the East."

In sum, the borrowing of Greek /moliwdos/ "lead" from Lydian *mariwda*- "dark, black" is linguistically viable. Lydians living in northwestern Asia Minor in the late-third and early-second millennium BC could easily have known and exploited local sources of lead. However, the evidence that Mycenaean Greeks were already chiefly exploiting local sources of lead for their use does seem to require that the putative first encounter of the Greeks with lead through the Lydians somewhere in northwestern Asia Minor – and hence the borrowing of the word for the metal – must have taken place at a relatively early date. Early in the second millennium or even late in the third would seem likely. Such a scenario is fully compatible with the Anatolian evidence (though it does require that the pre-Lydian sound change **y > d* be relatively early). One is then left to ask: Would the Indo-European-speaking Greeks have arrived in time for such an interaction? I can only raise this question here and must leave the further debate over the much-vexed question of the "arrival of the Greeks" to others better informed on the topic.

NOTES

- 1 Beekes admits (1999: 7, n. 1) that the Mycenaean spelling is unexpected for /moliwdos/ (one would not expect a syllable-final glide /w/ to be written), but he then rejects Chantraine's alternative with the odd assertion that "there is no reason to suppose it" (1999, 9). I cannot accept Beekes' claim that a fricative [v] or [β] "makes the assumed developments more difficult if not impossible." Such a sound would lead to Greek *b* just as easily as a [w], and rounding of the preceding vowel by a labial fricative is far from impossible. The unusual Mycenaean spelling may therefore be an attempt to write an unassimilated foreign sound. The issue is in any case of no

- consequence for our purposes, since Greek would necessarily have adapted to a *b* either a labial fricative or a glide in the unusual position before stop.
- 2 The other is in Text 79, a fragment from Aphrodisias in Caria (see Gusmani 1986, 154).
 - 3 German *Blei* "lead" and other Germanic cognates may also be derived from a color term seen in Lithuanian *blyvas* "violet-colored."
 - 4 For example, American English and Mandarin Chinese each have both a retroflex /r/ and an /l/, but the English /r/ is nevertheless treated as an /l/ in Mandarin, as in: Marilyn Monroe > Malilian Menglu. Loanword adaptation often involves folk etymological connections with words in the borrowing language, so we should also consider the possibility that the *l* in *mólybdos* is due to the influence of Greek *mélas* "black" or *moluúno* "to soil, stain, pollute" (pers. comm. of Michael Weiss).
 - 5 In view of other ethnic self-designations based simply on the word "people" or "human beings," Michael Weiss (pers. comm.) suggests the possibility that **māi-won-* is based on the same root as Hittite *maya(nt)-* "adult (male)" and Cuneiform Luwian *mayašša/i-* "of the community." This root would also be suitable semantically as the base of the name Madduwatta, a virtual **māi-wo-* "vigorous, manly."
 - 6 A derivation also made independently by Raphaël Gérard (2003; 2004, 125–32) and by Paul Widmer (2004). Gérard assumes that the source word is to be read *Lūya-*, which would lead directly to the Lydian by the change **y > d*, while Widmer argues alternatively that the standard reading *luwiya-* would also have led to **luwida-* and then syncopated **luwda-*, which could well have then contracted to **lūda-* with a long vowel preserved in the Greek form.
 - 7 Such an early date for the change of **y > d* in Lydian does raise the question of how the Greeks received the version *me:ion-/maion-* with preserved **y*. However, it is by no means rare that a people become known not by their own name for themselves, but by the name that their neighbors call them. Thus the Greek may reflect a **māiwones* preserved in another adjacent Anatolian Indo-European dialect (cf. van den Hout 2003, 307–8).
 - 8 I am most grateful to Eric Cline, James Muhly, and Susan Mossman for invaluable references and patient answers to my many questions on this complex issue. The standard disclaimer applies, and I am solely responsible for all views expressed here.

REFERENCES

- Aura Jorro, F. (1985) *Diccionario Micénico*. Madrid, C.S.I.C.
- Beekes, R. S. P. (1999) The Greek Word for "lead". *Münchener Studien zur Sprachwissenschaft* 59, 7–14.
- (2002) The Prehistory of the Lydians, the Origin of the Etruscans, Troy and Aeneas. *Bibliotheca Orientalis* 59, 205–41.
- (2003) Luwians and Lydians. *Kadmos* 42, 47–49.
- Branigan, K. (1974) *Aegean Metalwork of the Early and Middle Bronze Age*. Oxford, Clarendon.
- Buchholz, H.-G. (1972) Das Blei in der mykenischen Kultur und in der bronzezeitlichen Metallurgie Zyperns. *Jahrbuch des deutschen archäologischen Instituts* 87, 1–59.
- Carruba, O. (1995) L'arrivo dei greci, le migrazioni indoeuropee e il «ritorno» dei eraclidi. *Athenaeum* NS 83, 5–44.
- Chantraine, P. (1968) *Dictionnaire étymologique de la langue grecque*. Paris, Klincksieck.
- (1972) Le témoignage du mycénien pour l'étymologie grecque: δαί, Κοπρεύς, Κυκλεύς, μολοβρός, μόλυβδος. In M. Ruy Pérez (ed.) *Acta Mycenaea*, 2, 197–206. Salamanca, Universidad de Salamanca.
- Gale, N. H. (1979) Some Aspects of Lead and Silver Mining in the Aegean. *Miscellanea Graeca* 2, 9–60.
- Gale, N. H. and Z. A. Stos-Gale (1981) Cycladic Lead and Silver Metallurgy. *Annual of the British School at Athens* 76, 169–224.
- Gale, N. H., Stos-Gale, Z. A., and Davis, J. L. (1984) The Provenance of Lead Used at Ayia Irini, Keos. *Hesperia* 53, 389–406.
- Gérard, R. (2003) Le nom des Lydiens à la lumière des sources anatoliennes. *Le Muséon* 116, 4–7.
- (2004) Quelques remarques autour de **y > lydien d*. *Res Antiquae* 1, 125–32.
- Gusmani, R. (1986) *Lydisches Wörterbuch. Ergänzungsband, Lfg. 3*. Heidelberg, Carl Winter.
- Hawkins, J. D. (2000) *Corpus of Hieroglyphic Luwian Inscriptions. Volume I. Inscriptions of the Iron Age*. Berlin, de Gruyter.
- Högemann, P. (2001) Troias Untergang – was dann? Alte Dynastien, neue Reiche und die "Ionische Kolonisation" (12.–6. Jh. v. Chr.). In B. Theune-Großkopf et al. (eds.) *Troia: Traum und Wirklichkeit*, 58–63 Stuttgart, Konrad Theiss.

- Hout, T. van den (2003) Maeonien und Maddunnašša: zur Frühgeschichte des Lydischen. In M. Giorgieri et al. (eds.) *Licia e lidia prima dell'ellenizzazione*, 301–10. Rome, CNR.
- Melchert, H. C. (1990) Adjectives in *-iyo- in Anatolian. *Historische Sprachforschung* 103, 198–207.
- (1994) PIE *y > Lydian d. In P. Vavroušek (ed.) *Iranian and Indo-European Studies. Memorial Volume of Otakar Klíma*, 181–87. Prague, Enigma.
- (1997) PIE Dental Stops in Lydian. In D. Q. Adams (ed.) *Festschrift for Eric P. Hamp*, 2:32–47. Washington, DC, Institute for the Study of Man.
- (2002) The God Sanda in Lycia? In P. Taracha (ed.) *Silva Anatolica. Anatolian Studies Presented to Maciej Popko on the Occasion of His 65th Birthday*, 241–51. Warsaw, Agade.
- (2003) Prehistory. In H. C. Melchert (ed.) *The Luwians*, 8–26. Leiden, Brill.
- Mossman, S. (2000) Mycenaean Age Lead: a Fresh Look at an Old Material. Pp. 85–119 in *Trade and Production in Premonetary Greece: Acquisition and Distribution of Raw Materials and Finished Products. Proceedings of the 6th International Workshop, Athens 1996*, eds. Carole Gillis et al. Jonsered, Åströms.
- Neumann, G. (1961) *Untersuchungen zum Weiterleben hethitischen und luwischen Sprachgutes in hellenistischer und römischer Zeit*. Wiesbaden, Harrassowitz.
- (1973) Review of Liane Jakob-Rost, *Das Ritual der Malli aus Arzawa gegen Behexung* (Texte der Hethiter 2). *Zeitschrift für Vergleichende Sprachforschung* 87, 295–99.
- (2001) Der Große Nachbar in Anatolien. Die Hethiter. In B. Theune-Großkopf et al. (eds.) *Troia: Traum und Wirklichkeit*, 46–50. Stuttgart, Konrad Theiss.
- Oettinger, N. (1989/90) Die "dunkle Erde" im Hethitischen und Griechischen. *Welt des Orients* 20/21, 83–98.
- (2002) Indogermanische Sprachträger lebten schon im 3. Jahrtausend v. Chr. in Kleinasien. In H. Willinghöfer and U. Hasekamp (eds.) *Die Hethiter und ihr Reich. Das Volk der 1000 Götter*, 5–55. Stuttgart, Konrad Theiss.
- Popko, M. (1995) *Religions of Asia Minor*. Warsaw, Academic Publications Dialog.
- Starke, F. (1986) Review of Hans G. Güterbock and Harry A. Hoffner, Jr., *The Hittite Dictionary of the Oriental Institute of the University of Chicago*, Vol. 3/2. *Bibliotheca Orientalis* 43, 157–65.
- (1997) Troia im Kontext des historisch-politischen und sprachlichen Umfeldes Kleinasien im 2. Jahrtausend. *Studia Troica* 7, 446–87.
- Stos-Gale, Z. A. and Gale, N. H. (1982) The Sources of Mycenaean Silver and Lead. *Journal of Field Archaeology* 9, 467–85.
- Widmer, P. (2004) Λυδία: Ein Toponym zwischen Orient und Okzident. *Historische Sprachforschung* 117, 197–203.